

REVIEW
**of the official reviewer for PhD thesis on the topic «Innovation management of
quality in higher education of the Republic of Kazakhstan»
by Manarbek Gulden Manarbekkyzy
submitted for the award of degree of doctor of philosophy (PhD)
in the 6D051700 – «Innovation management» specialty**

The PhD thesis was submitted for review in English. The volume of the PhD thesis is 145 pages without appendixes. It consists of the following structural elements: title page, content, normative references, notations and abbreviations, introduction, main part, conclusion, references, 7 appendixes. The main part consists of 8 paragraphs. PhD thesis includes all required elements such as theoretical part with an extensive review, analytical part with qualitative and quantitative analysis, final part with practical recommendations.

1. The relevance of the research topic and its relationship with general scientific and national programs. The purpose of the PhD thesis is to develop innovative approach for quality management of higher education in Kazakhstan.

The relevance of this research is due to the fact that it is directly related to the policy pursued in the country. The strategic course of Kazakhstan to enter the number of thirty developed countries of the world and the formation of a knowledge-based economy in the country requires developed human capital and effective system of higher education, the importance of development of which has been repeatedly emphasized in the Addresses of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan. So, in State of the nation Address «Kazakhstan in a new reality: time for action» dated September 1, 2020, K.-J. Tokayev outlined one of the 11 tasks - «accessible and quality education», which in turn affects the achievement of another one task related to formation and development of a new quality of the nation.

High-quality education depends on effective quality management and appropriate organizational change in universities. The role of internal governance of universities to effective quality management of higher education is increasing. So, on May 18, 2020, amendments and additions were made to the Standard Rules for the activities of educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and (or) postgraduate education, according to which «in order to improve the quality of educational activities, the university creates an internal quality assurance system based on international standards and guidelines to ensure the quality of higher and postgraduate education in the European higher education area».

On July 4, 2018, there was adopted the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan «On amendments and additions to some legislative acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the issues of expansion of academic and governance autonomy of higher education institutions». Within the framework of this law, universities were given appropriate autonomy. Academic, financial and managerial freedom of universities will contribute increase the competition among them at the education and labor markets. In this regard, it is significantly important for university management to reconsider their organizational behavior and to sustain the capability of maintaining competitive at the market through focusing on quality management practices.

The PhD thesis corresponds to the other basic strategies, programs and documents such as «The Strategy for development of the Republic of Kazakhstan until the year 2050», «The Plan of the nation «100 concrete steps to implement five institutional reforms of the First President-Elbasy N. Nazarbayev», «The State program for the development of education and science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025», etc.

The foregoing determines the undoubted relevance of the PhD thesis topic and its relationship with general scientific and national programs of Kazakhstan.

2. Scientific results and their validity. In the course of the research, based on the analysis, synthesis and generalization of theoretical and empirical material, the author obtained the following scientific results (provisions), submitted for defense:

- 1) the author's own conceptualization of the term «quality in higher education» from perspectives of stakeholders' perceptions;
- 2) justification of applicability of business quality management techniques in higher education through the study of university governance types;
- 3) development of the adapted version of the EFQM excellence model as an innovative quality management tool in higher education;
- 4) recommendation on improvement of quality management practices in Kazakhstani HEIs based on adopted version of the EFQM model.

The scientific results of PhD thesis are sufficiently substantiated and reasoned, supported by the necessary evidence base. Thus, the reliability and validity of the research results are determined by the clarity of the conceptual provisions of the research, the deep analysis of a large number of used sources, including foreign ones, also reports of national and international organizations and legislative acts of Kazakhstan, the using primary and secondary data and a set of complementary quantitative and qualitative methods, the careful analysis of the obtained data. The research results are presented in graphical and tabular form, which greatly facilitates their perception and does not allow doubting their reliability. There have been proven the validity of the research methodology and its relevance to the posed problem.

3. The degree of validity and reliability of each scientific result (scientific provision), conclusions of the applicant, formulated in the PhD thesis.

The first scientific provision has a high degree of validity and reliability, since the theoretical and methodological basis of the PhD thesis was the main provisions of quality management theory. The author's vision of the economic essence of the term «quality education» is based on an extensive and comprehensive analysis of scientific works, including foreign and domestic researchers.

The second scientific provision has a high degree of validity and reliability, since the author studied and generalized world experience on implementation new public management in higher education organizations. It is also based on an analysis of the results of a survey of administration and academic staff of Kazakhstani universities, the validity and reliability of which was tested by the Cronbach Alpha test and the factor loading analysis. Testing results show a high level of validity.

The third scientific provision has a high degree of validity and reliability since the theoretical and methodological basis is provisions of TQM and NPM, EFQM excellence model and IPO model, ISO standards and scientific works.

The fourth scientific provision has a high degree of validity and reliability since the proposed scientific and practical recommendations are based on mentioned before author's calculations and a broad analysis of foreign experience in this area.

The scientific results (provisions) of the PhD thesis are characterized by a high degree of validity and reliability and are not in doubt.

4. The degree of novelty of each scientific result (scientific provision), conclusions of the applicant, formulated in the PhD thesis. The author's approach can be traced in the study of theoretical aspects of the research problem, methodological approaches and practical recommendations obtained in the course of a deep and complex analysis.

The first scientific provision is new. Based on the perspectives of stakeholders' perceptions, there is presented the author's vision of the economic essence of the term «quality education», where quality defined by gap between expectations and perceptions of stakeholders.

The second scientific provision is partly new. The applicability of business quality management techniques in higher education was considered by foreign authors. The novelty of this study focuses on types of university governance, especially on internal governance.

The third scientific provision is partly new. The applicability of EFQM excellence model as a quality management tool in higher education was considered by foreign authors. The novelty of this study is that some criteria of the EFQM model was rearranged to encompass needs of both external and internal stakeholders of the university and this model was adapted for higher education organization in Kazakhstan that was conducted for the first time. Also author has developed an appropriate mechanism for its implementation at the university in Kazakhstan.

The fourth scientific provision is new. Its novelty is explained by the author's recommendations for improving the quality management practices in Kazakhstani HEIs that has never been suggested before.

Thus, the PhD thesis results are new, since they not previously comprehensively investigated in the scientific works of domestic researchers.

5. Practical and theoretical significance of scientific results. The value of the PhD thesis is determined by the lack of fundamental works on the problem under study in domestic science, with an abundance of works devoted to particular aspects of the research problem.

The theoretical significance of the PhD thesis results lies in the fact that they generalize, develop and supplement scientific knowledge in the quality management theory, in particular, they contribute to the further development of the concept of internal governance in higher education, which testifies to the personal contribution of the author to economic science development. The significance of this research is also due to an attempt to improve the methodological tools for the study of quality management in universities. The results of the PhD thesis can become the basis for the formulation of new research problems.

The PhD thesis results can serve as recommendations for government agencies, in particular for the Ministry of education and science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, higher education organizations and other stakeholders of the higher education system.

Thus, the results of the study can be useful in the framework of the implementation of the Anti-crisis Plan for the development of higher education, announced by the Minister in August 2020. Conclusions, proposals and scientific and practical recommendations can be taken into account and used by the administration of universities to develop an effective quality management system in order to ensure quality education and to be competitive in educational and labor markets.

The theoretical and analytical material of the PhD thesis can be used in the educational process, in particular in such disciplines as «Management», «Innovation management», «Economics of education», etc.

6. Comments, suggestions on the thesis. With an overall positive assessment of the PhD thesis, a number of comments and suggestions should be made:

1. In PhD thesis not enough attention is paid for substantiating the internal governance of organization for quality management as a mission of the university, reflecting the uniqueness of higher education organization, substantiating its existence and interaction with society, showing the socio-economic impact of its activities;

2. In PhD thesis not enough attention is paid for analyzing current practice on quality management in Kazakhstani universities with specific examples (for example, case-studies of selected universities) depending on the form of ownership, status, location and other characteristics of higher education organizations in Kazakhstan;

3. In PhD thesis there were used 299 sources, however, the number of scientific publications over the past five years (2016-2020) is only 10%.

The comments and suggestions generally do not affect the overall positive impression of research work.

7. Compliance with the content of the thesis in the framework of the requirements of the Rules for awarding academic degrees. PhD thesis of Manarbek Gulden Manarbekkyzy titled «Innovation management of quality in higher education of the Republic of Kazakhstan» is completed research work with inner unity, which is of great theoretical and applied importance. The PhD thesis fully complies with the requirements of the Rules for awarding academic degrees. And the author deserves to be awarded the degree of doctor of philosophy (PhD) in the 6D051700 – «Innovation management» specialty.

Senior researcher of
department of regional economy
and innovative development of
Institute of economy of SC MES RK.
PhD

February 15, 2021



Satpayeva Z.T.

Z.T. Satpayeva

Қолын растаймын.

ҚР Білім және ғылым министрлігі
Ғылым комитетінің

«Экономика институты» РМҚК

Кадрлар бөлімі *Самалова А.К.*